

The Credibility of Deviant Ahaadeeth on the Distortion of the Holy Quran among the Shi'ite Imamate in Al-Kaafiy by Al-Kulayniy.

Mohd Azri Mohd Nasaruddin¹ and Kamaluddin Nurdin Marjuni^{2 +}

^{1,2} Islamic Science University of Malaysia

¹ Universiti Malaysia Perlis

Abstract. Deviant and manipulated ahaadeeth on the distortion of the Holy Quran from the classical hadeeth books of the Shi'ite are something already known among the Sunni scholars. A lot of articles, academic or non-academic had already listed the examples that we can find. This article deals with some of the ahaadeeth by going deeper analytically and brought forward Shi'ite's jurisdiction, their stand as well as their belief in them.

Keywords: Deviant Ahaadeeth, Quran, Shi'ite Imamate.

1. Introduction

In the academic world of the hadeeth and its sciences, they are certain matters that are not too strict on their nature, and a degree of leniency is well accepted in dealing with a certain *sanad* (chain of narrators) and *matan* (the text) of a hadeeth. In fact, the strictness in such would eventually bring a narrow degree of analytical thinking, as well as a limited number of collections of the hadeeth of the Prophet (pbuh). It was reported that 'Ali bin Al-Madiniy once said: "If I left out the residents of Basrah (from listening to their hadeeth) for the reason of them being *Qadariy*, and if I left out the residents of Kufah because of their opinion (of leaning towards Shi'ah) surely the books (of hadeeth) will be ruined" (Al-Baghdaadiy 1938, pp. 157). Ibnu Hajar said: "The correct view is that the narrations from those who are deemed as *kaafir* (disbeliever) for his heresy are not fully rejected, for every sect will deem their opposite sect's view as heretical, so may they deem them as *kaafir*. The approved view is that those whom their narration is rejected are those who refuted *mutawaatir* (frequently reported matters, narrated by a vast number of trusted individuals that is it impossible for all of them to meet and agree on lying about the Prophet pbuh) matters from the known *syari'ah* (Islamic ruling) of fundamental beliefs, as well as those who rejected them" (Ibnu Hajar, 2001, pp. 138).

The very same ruling applies to the ahaadeeth of the Prophet (pbuh). Every narration has to be tested both its chain of narrators and content, for the very definition of a sound hadeeth is "a hadeeth that was narrated continuously from a chain of narrators that are trusted and reliable, without any signs of abnormality nor illness" (Mahmud Tahhan, 2006, pp. 11). A hadeeth that clearly refutes any of the *mutawaatir* components of Islam, thus, is rejected and considered as a deviation.

A number of ahaadeeth that are found the Shi'ite's classical books of hadeeth, mainly Al-Kaafiy by Al-Kulayniy, clearly refutes what is considered as *mutawaatir* by the vast majority of Muslims, i.e the Holy Quran (As-Sayuthy, 1/8). Much of these ahaadeeth had been brought forward by various articles and books. However, the critic on these writings, is that they usually put forward ahaadeeth that already been rejected by the Shi'ite themselves. It is no longer a valid debate or a discussion anymore, if any of the rejected hadeeth was brought forward as an evidence of deviation. That is why, from the author's point of view, it is important to examine these ahaadeeth before presenting them in an argument. This is to be done not by using the methods of the Sunni, rather through the methods of the Shi'ite themselves. This way the validity and acceptability of the ahaadeeth could not be refuted, thus disposing their true faith and belief in a given hadeeth.

⁺ Corresponding author. Tel.: +609 798 8282.
E-mail address: kamaluddin@usim.edu.my

2. The Position of A Weak Hadeeth Among the Shi'te

2.1. The invalidity of the *sanad* does not invalidates the content

Contrary to the scientific method of hadeeth among the Sunni, which rejects completely weak ahaadeeth from being used in the matters of faith (Abu Lais, 2003, pp. 73), the Shi'ite on the other hand, could well accept weak ahaadeeth in this area of discussion. To quote from Hasyim Ma'ruf Al-Hasaniy: "That the continuous number of weak ahaadeeth in Al-Kaafiy does not mean that they are not accepted in the discussion of religious matters. That is because the narration is described as weak from the angle of its sanad. This does not downgrades its strength in the second angle, such as its existence in the *Al-Usool Al-Arba'umiah*, or in other well-known books. Or because these ahaadeeth are being practiced by various scholars, as it is reported from vast source of narrations that if a hadeeth is strongly adhered to as well as being widely practiced among the scholars, it will be at the same degree of acceptance as other valid ahaadeeth" (Hasyim Ma'ruf, 1999, pp. 137).

Therefore, the acceptance of a hadeeth in the Shi'te school should not be stopped by its nature of being a weak hadeeth. Further comments, critics and supports from Shi'ites scholar have to come along with the listing of the ahaadeeth, as to reveal the real position of a particular hadeeth in their system of faith.

3. Examples of Deviant Hadeeth on the Distortion of Al-Quran From Al-Kaafiy

3.1. Hadeeth on the Actual Number of Verses of the Quran

Al-Kulayniy reported from 'Ali bin Al-Hukmu, from Hisyam bin Saalim, from Abi Abdillah: "Verily the Quran that has been brought by Jibrail (pbuh) to Muhammad (pbuh) is 17,000 verses" (Al-Kulayniy, 2/635).

Al-Majlisiy classed this hadeeth as *muwassaq* (trusted and valid) (Al-Majlisiy, 12/525). He then commented: "This hadeeth is not a secret, in fact a lot valid reports suggested the deficiency of the Quran, and from my opinion this report is *mutawaatir* by its meaning (*Ibid.*) etc. Al-Maazandaraaniy added to this comment: "According to the writings of Saalim bin Qias Al-Hilaaliy, Amirul Mu'minin Ali did not come out from his home after the death of the Prophet (pbuh), until he had managed to collect each and every single Quranic verses from the abrogates and the abrogated, the arbitrators and the confusables, as well as the promised and the intimidations, and they were about 18,000 verses. These deficiencies were caused by distortions, and the distortion of the Quran is well known from our ahaadeeth that is *mutawaatir* by their meaning of context" (Al-Maazandaraaniy, 2000, 11/88).

Thus the belief among the Shi'ite regarding the total number of Quranic verses s beyond refutable, and clearly it contradicts the known *mutawaatir* belief that the Quran was transmitted to us as it is, and that it will never be distorted until the Judgement Day (Al-Quran, 15:9).

3.2. The hadeeth on the Mandate of Ali ra

Al-Kulayniy reported: "From a number of our friends, from Ahmad bin Ahmad, from Al-Husayn bin Sa'id, from a part of our companions, from Ahmad bin Sudair, from Saalim bin Ahmad: "I said unto Abi Abdillah: Tell me about the verse "With it came down the spirit of Faith and Truth, to thy heart and mind, mayest thou be admonish" (Al-Quran, 26: 193-194)". He (Abu Abdillah) said: "It speaks about the Mandate of Ali" (Al-Kulayniy, 1/610).

This hadeeth was classed as *mursal* (narrated from the Prophet pbuh without mentioning his name) (Al-Majlisiy, 5/1). He then commented: "The apparent meaning of the verse –with 'it'- originally is the Quran itself, while the interpretation of the Imam could be in two ways; One, is that the Quran contains a lot of verses that speaks about the Mandate of Ali, or that the verses in the Quran are the pillar for the Mandate. Two, is that the news in the Quran are only perfected with the opinions of the Imam, for they are the Keeper for its verses and the Interpreter for its context" (*Ibid.*). Al-Maazandaraaniy later added: "And he (the Imam) interpreted the verse as 'the Mandate came through *Ar-Ruhul Amin*, that is Jibrail (pbuh) to your heart, O Muhammad, for you to be a reminder for those who refuted the Heir of your will, in the clear language of Arabic, so that they won't say in the Day of Judgement: We did not understand what you were saying about your Heir" (Al-Maazandaraaniy 2000, 7/51).

None of the famous scholars of *tafseer* interpreted this verse as the Mandate of Ali, for there was not a single sign or evidence that suggests it, apart from reports as the like of above, that came with a weak chain of narrators (At-Tabari 1993, 9/475. Ibnu Katsir 2000, 3/462. Al-Qurtubi 1992, 13/125. As-Syaukaaniy, 4/173. As-Sayuthy 1993, 1/491. As-Sayuthy, 6/321). Ibnu Taimiyah (1995, 7/31) refuted the idea of the Mandate of Ali as impossible, since if ever it is true, and Abu Bakr and Umar were hypocrites that ruled above of Ali, this is a clear contradiction from the words of Allah “As to those who turn (for friendship or *wali*) to Allah, His Messenger, and the (fellowship of) believers, it is the fellowship of Allah that must certainly triumph” (Al-Quran, 5:56).

3.3. The hadeeth on the Mandate of the Infallible Imams

Al-Kulayniy reported from Muhammad bin Yahya, from Ahmad bin Ahmad, from Ibnu Mahbub, from Al-Husayn bin Nua'im As-Sahaaf, he said: “I asked Abu Abdillah about the verse “and of you are some that are Unbelievers, and some that are Believers” (Al-Quran, 64:2) then he said: “Allah has Knew their faith with regards to our Mandate, and they refuted it, “on the Day He Takes the charter from the heart of Adam (pbuh) and it is as small as an atom” ” (Al-Kulayniy, 1/414).

Al-Majlisiy classed this hadeeth as *hasan* (good). He commented: “As it is presented, the verse could have been abrogated, or that in the *mushaf* of the Imam it is as such, and here it was narrated by the transmitter through its meaning, not through the original context” (Al-Majlisiy, 5/10). In their belief it is known among the Imam who is considered as believers and who is considered as infidels (Al-Kulayniy, 1/644), thus it is logical for the Creator of men Knew this as well (Al-Majlisiy, *op. cit.*). Al-Maazandaraaniy also brought forward a long discusson on this that mimics the commentary of Al-Majlisiy (11/88).

The issu on the Mandate of the Infallible Imams is as the same as the issue on the Mandate of Ali on the above-mentioned hadeeth.

3.4. The hadeeth on the covenant of Adam (pbuh) regarding the family of the Prophet (pbuh)

Al-Kulayniy reported from Al-Husayn bin Muhammad, from Ma'la bin Muhammad, from Ja'far bin Muhammad bin 'Ubaidullah, from Muhammad bin 'Isa Al-Qummiy, from Muhammad bin Sulayman, from 'Ubaidillah bin Sanaan, from Abu Abdillah, who said about the verse: “We had already, beforehand, taken the covenant of Adam ‘about Muhammad and Ali and Fatimah and Hasan and Hasayn and the Imams from their descendants’, but he forgot” by Allah this is how the verse was sent down” (Al-Kulayniy, 1/417).

Originally in the Quran this verse only reads “We had already, beforehand, taken the covenant of Adam but he forgot” (Al-Quran, 20:115).

Even though Al-Majlisiy had classed this hadeeth as a weak hadeeth, he commented after wise: “Apparently, in fact, clearly, this was how the verse was sent, and the interpretation is to be interpreted accordingly to the meaning of the verse (as mentioned by the Imam). Jibrail (pbuh) had stated that this is the meaning of this verse when it was sent down” (Al-Majlisiy, 5/10). Al-Maazandaraaniy echoes the same statement (7/65). In the footnote of the comment by Al-Maazandaraaniy, Al-Mirza Abu Al-Hasan As-Sya'raaniy stated: “His statement ‘this is how it was when it was sent down, it is not an interpretation’ is a strong defensive statement against those who are saying that every hadeeth similar to this means that they contradict with the Quranic version that we have today. Rather this is more to the interpretation of the verse, not the literal words, and this is a better understanding” (*Ibid.*).

From the author's opinion, whether it is a literal meaning, or just an interpretation, the belief that the verse contains or sounded the way it was narrated itself is a deviancy from the original verse of the Holy Quran. It does not matters much about the literal discussion on the hadeeth, rather the belief itself contradicts with the *mutawaatir* understanding of the Holy Quran.

3.5. The hadeeth on the obedience to the Mandate of Ali and his descendant

Al-Kulayniy reported from Al-Hasan bin Muhammad, from Ma'la bin Muhammad, from 'Ali bin Al-Asbad, from 'Ali bin Abi Hamzah, from Abi Busair, from Abu Abdillah in commenting Allah's verse: “He that obeys Allah and His Messenger in the Mandate of Ali and the Mandate of the Imams after him has already attained the highest achievement” he said: “This was how it was sent down” (Al-Kulayniy, 1/415).

Originally the verse in the Quran: “He that obeys Allah and His Messenger has already attained the highest achievement” (Al-Quran, 33:71).

Al-Majlisiy classed this hadeeth as a weak hadeeth, but he commented: “Apparently the meaning of the original verse is as such, or this verse serves as a pillar for ‘Ali’s mandate, since no obedience is complete without the faith in his Mandate. This meaning is supported by the fact that it is revealed after the verse “Blood-relations among each other have closer personal ties, in the Decree of Allah than (the Brotherhood of) Believers and Muhajirs” (Al-Quran, 33:6). Al-Maazandaraaniy added: “His words ‘this was how it was sent down’ clearly indicates that this verse was sent down as it is literally, however it was changed by the means of distortion. Nevertheless it still contains this meaning, and the knowledge about the Mandate of ‘Ali and the Imams after him came through this literal revelation, not by interpretation” (Al-Maazandaraaniy, 7/56).

4. Acknowledgements

The author would like to thank Dr. Kamaluddin Marjuni Al-Bugisy, the co-author of this article for his suggestions and review of the final draft of this article. Also to dear wife Iman Abdull Halim and daughter Ilya Intisaar who had always been a source of inspiration and motivation for the author in the pursuit of knowledge and wisdom.

5. References

- [1] Al-Khatib Al-Baghdadiy, Ahmad bin Ali bin Tsabit. *Al-Kifayah fi ‘Ilmi Ar-Riwaayah*. Daairah Al-Ma’ruf Al-Uthmaaniyah, 1938.
- [2] Ibnu Hajar, Ahmad bin Ali bin Muhammad. *Nuzhatun Nazr Tawdih Nukhbatul Fikri*. 2001.
- [3] Mahmud Tahhan. *Taisir Mustolah Al-Hadis*. Markaz Al-Huda Li Ad-Diraasat, 2006.
- [4] Jalaluddin As-Sayuthy, Abdul Rahman bin Abi Bakr. *Al-Itqaan fi ‘Uluumi Al-Quran*. Markaz Ad-Diraasat Al-Quraniyah.
- [5] _____ . *Ad-Duru Al-Manthur*. Beirut: Darul Fikri, 1993.
- [6] Abu Lais, Muhammad Al-Khayr Abadiy. *‘Uluumul Hadeth Usoiliha Wa Mu’asiruha*. Malaysia: Darul Syakir, 2003.
- [7] Hasyim Ma’ruf Al-Hasaniy. *Diraasat fi Al-Hadis wal Muhaddithun*. Tehran: Darul Ma’aruf, 1999.
- [8] Al-Kulayniy, Muhammad bin Ya’qub Abu Ja’far. *Al-Kaafiy*. Commentary by ‘Ali Akbar Al-Ghaffaariy. Tehran: Darul Kutub Al-Islamiyyah.
- [9] Al-Allamah Al-Majlisiy, Muhammad Al-Baaqir. *Miraatu Al-‘Uquul fi Syarhi Ahaadisi Aali Ar-Rasul*. Tehran: Darul Kutub Al-Islamiyyah.
- [10] Al-Maazandaraaniy, Mawla Muhammad Soleh. *Syarh Usool Al-Kaafiy*. Commentary by Al-Miraz Abu Al-Hasan As-Sya’raaniy. 2000.
- [11] At-Tabari, Muhammad bin Jarir bin Yazid. *Jaami’ul Bayaan ‘An Ta’wil Aayi Al-Quran*. Beirut: Darul Ma’rifah, 1993.
- [12] Ibnu Katsir, Ismail bin Umar. *Tafsir Al-Quran Al-‘Azhim*. Beirut: Darul Salaam. 2000.
- [13] Al-Qurtubi, Muhammad bin Ahmad bin Abi Bakr. *Al-Jaami’ Li Ahkaam Al-Quran*. Beirut: Darul At-Turath Al-‘Arabiyy, 1992.
- [14] As-Syaukaaniy, Muhammad bin ‘Ali. *Fathul Qaadir Al-Jaami’ fi Fanni Ar-Riwayah wa Ad-Diraayah*. Beirut.
- [15] Ibnu Taimiyah, Ahmad bin Abdul Halim. *Minhaajus Sunnah*. Beirut: Darul At-Turath Al-‘Arabiyy, 1995.